The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning

The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning is the first comprehensive and authoritative handbook covering all the core topics of the field of thinking and reasoning. Written by the foremost experts from cognitive psychology, cognitive science, and cognitive neuroscience, individual chapters summarize basic concepts and findings for a major topic, sketch its history, and give a sense of the directions in which research is currently heading. The volume also includes work related to developmental, social and clinical psychology, philosophy, economics, artificial intelligence, linguistics, education, law, and medicine. Scholars and students in all these fields and others will find this to be a valuable collection.

Keith J. Holyoak is a Distinguished Professor in the Department of Psychology at the University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA). He has made a number of major contributions to the scientific understanding of human thinking and has pioneered modern work on the role of analogy in thinking.

Robert G. Morrison is president of Xunesis (www.xunesis.org), a not-for-profit company that encourages people to integrate science with their everyday lives through performance and media art that engages, entertains, and educates in both traditional and nontraditional educational settings. He received his Ph.D. in cognitive neuroscience from UCLA. His research involves understanding how the human brain implements and constrains higher cognition.
The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning

Edited by
Keith J. Holyoak
and
Robert G. Morrison
The editors gratefully dedicate this volume to
Patricia Wenjie Cheng
(from KJH)
and
Deborah Lee Morrison
(from RGM)
Contents

Preface ix
Contributors xi

Part I
The Nature of Human Concepts

1. Thinking and Reasoning: A Reader’s Guide
Keith J. Holyoak
Robert G. Morrison 1

2. Similarity
Robert L. Goldstone
Ji Yun Son 13

3. Concepts and Categories: Memory, Meaning, and Metaphysics
Douglas L. Medin
Lance J. Rips 37

Leonidas A. A. Doumas
John E. Hummel 73

Part II
Reasoning

5. The Problem of Induction
Steven A. Sloman
David A. Lagnado 95

6. Analogy
Keith J. Holyoak 117

7. Causal Learning
Marc J. Buehner
Patricia W. Cheng 143

8. Deductive Reasoning
Jonathan St. B. T. Evans 169

9. Mental Models and Thought
P. N. Johnson-Laird 185

10. Visuospatial Reasoning
Barbara Tversky 209

Part III
Judgment and Decision Making

11. Decision Making
Robyn A. LeBoeuf
Eldar B. Shafir 243
# The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning

Edited by Keith J. Holyoak and Robert G. Morrison

## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>A Model of Heuristic Judgment</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Daniel Kahneman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shane Frederick</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Motivated Thinking</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Daniel C. Molden</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E. Tory Higgins</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART IV</strong></td>
<td><strong>PROBLEM SOLVING AND COMPLEX LEARNING</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Problem Solving</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Laura R. Novick</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Miriam Bassok</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Creativity</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robert J. Sternberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Todd J. Lubart</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>James C. Kaufman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jean E. Pretz</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Complex Declarative Learning</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Michelle T. H. Chi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stellan Ohlsson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Thinking as a Production System</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marsha C. Loffett</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John R. Anderson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Implicit Cognition and Thought</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Leib Litman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arthur S. Reber</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART V</strong></td>
<td><strong>COGNITIVE AND NEURAL CONSTRAINTS ON HUMAN THOUGHT</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Thinking in Working Memory</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robert G. Morrison</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Cognitive Neuroscience of Deductive Reasoning</td>
<td>475</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vinod Goel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Cognitive and Neuroscience Aspects of Thought Disorder</td>
<td>493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peter Bachman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tyrone D. Cannon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART VI</strong></td>
<td><strong>ONTOGENY, PHYLOGENY, LANGUAGE, AND CULTURE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Development of Thinking</td>
<td>529</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graeme S. Halford</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Mathematical Cognition</td>
<td>559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. R. Gallistel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rochel Gelman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Effects of Aging on Reasoning</td>
<td>589</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Timothy A. Salthouse</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Reasoning and Thinking in Nonhuman Primates</td>
<td>607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Josep Call</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Michael Tomasello</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Language and Thought</td>
<td>633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lila Gleitman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Anna Papafragou</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Paradigms of Cultural Thought</td>
<td>663</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Patricia M. Greenfeld</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART VII</strong></td>
<td><strong>THINKING IN PRACTICE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>Legal Reasoning</td>
<td>685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Phoebe C. Ellsworth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>Scientific Thinking and Reasoning</td>
<td>705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kevin Dunbar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jonathan Fugelsang</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>Thinking and Reasoning in Medicine</td>
<td>727</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vimla L. Patel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jose F. Arecha</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jiezie Zhang</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Intelligence</td>
<td>751</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robert J. Sternberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Learning to Think: The Challenges of Teaching Thinking</td>
<td>775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ron Ritchhart</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>David N. Perkins</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index | 803 |

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org
A few decades ago, when the science of cognition was in its infancy, the early textbooks on cognition began with perception and attention and ended with memory. So-called higher-level cognition – the mysterious, complicated realm of thinking and reasoning – was simply left out. Things have changed – any good cognitive text (and there are many) devotes several chapters to topics such as categorization, inductive and deductive reasoning, judgment and decision making, and problem solving. What has still been missing, however, is a true handbook for the field of thinking and reasoning – a book meant to be kept close “at hand” by those involved in the field. Such a book would bring together top researchers to write chapters, each of which summarizes the basic concepts and findings for a major topic, sketches its history, and provides a sense of the directions in which research is currently heading. This handbook would provide quick overviews for experts in each topic area, and more importantly for experts in allied topic areas (because few researchers can keep up with the scientific literature over the full breadth of the field of thinking and reasoning). Even more crucially, this handbook would provide an entry point into the field for the next generation of researchers by providing a text for use in classes on thinking and reasoning designed for graduate students and upper-level undergraduates. The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning is intended to be this previously missing handbook. The project was first conceived at the meeting of the Cognitive Science Society in Edinburgh, Scotland, during the summer of 2001. The contents of the volume are sketched in Chapter 1. Our aim is to provide comprehensive and authoritative reviews of all the core topics of the field of thinking and reasoning, with many pointers for further reading. Undoubtedly, there are still omissions, but we have included as much as we could realistically fit in a single volume. Our focus is on research from cognitive psychology, cognitive science, and cognitive neuroscience, but we also include work related to developmental, social, and clinical psychology; philosophy; economics; artificial intelligence; linguistics; education; law; and medicine. We hope that scholars and students in all these
fields and others will find this to be a valuable collection.

We have many to thank for their help in bringing this endeavor to fruition. Philip Laughlin, our editor at Cambridge University Press, gave us exactly the balance of encouragement and patience we needed. It is fitting that a handbook of thinking and reasoning should bear the imprint and indeed the name of this illustrious press, with its long history reaching back to the origins of scientific inquiry. Michie Shaw, Senior Project Manager at TechBooks, provided us with close support throughout the arduous editing process. At UCLA, Christine Vu did a great deal of organizational work in her role as our editorial assistant for the entire project. During this period, our own efforts were supported by grants R305H030141 from the Institute of Education Sciences and SES-0080375 from the National Science Foundation to KJH, and from Xunesis and National Service Research Award MH-064244 from the National Institute of Mental Health to RGM.

Then there are the authors. (It would seem a bit presumptuous to call them “our” authors!) People working on tough intellectual problems sometimes experience a moment of insight – a sense that although many laborious steps may lay ahead, the basic elements of a solution are already in place. Such fortunate people work on happily, confident that ultimate success is assured. In preparing this handbook, we also had our moment of “insight.” It came when all these outstanding researchers agreed to join our project. Before the first chapter was drafted, we knew the volume was going to be of the highest quality. Along the way, our distinguished authors graciously served as each other’s critics as we passed drafts around, working to make the chapters as integrated as possible, adding in pointers from one to another. Then the authors all changed hats again and went back to work revising their own chapters in light of the feedback their peers had provided. We thank you all for making our own small labors a great pleasure.

KEITH J. HOLYOAK
University of California, Los Angeles

ROBERT G. MORRISON
Xunesis, Chicago

October 2004
Contributors

JOHN R. ANDERSON
Carnegie Mellon University
Department of Psychology
Pittsburgh, PA 15213-3890
ja+@cmu.edu

JOSÉ F. AROCHA
Department of Health Studies & Gerontology
University of Waterloo
200 University Ave. W.
Waterloo, Ontario
Canada N2L 3G1
jarocha@healthy.uwaterloo.ca

PETER BACHMAN
University of California, Los Angeles
Department of Psychology
Franz Hall
Los Angeles, CA 90095-1563
bachman@psych.ucla.edu

MIRIAM BASSOK
University of Washington
Department of Psychology
Box 351225
Seattle, WA 98195-1525
mbassok@u.washington.edu

MARC J. BUEHNER
School of Psychology
Cardiff University
Tower Building
Park Place
Cardiff, CF10 3AT
Wales, UK
BuehnerM@Cardiff.ac.uk

JOSEP CALL
Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology
Deutscher Platz 6
D-04103 Leipzig, Germany
call@eva.mpg.de

TYRONE D. CANNON
University of California, Los Angeles
Department of Psychology
Franz Hall
Los Angeles, CA 90095-1563
cannon@psych.ucla.edu

PATRICIA W. CHENG
University of California, Los Angeles
Department of Psychology
Franz Hall
Los Angeles, CA 90095-1563
cheng@psych.ucla.edu
Contributors

Michelene T. H. Chi
University of Pittsburgh
Learning Research and Development Center
3530 O’Hara Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15260
chi@pitt.edu

Leonidas A. A. Doumas
University of California, Los Angeles
Department of Psychology
Franz Hall
Los Angeles, CA 90095-1565
adoumas@psych.ucla.edu

Kevin Dunbar
Dartmouth College
Department of Psychological & Brain Sciences
Hanover, NH 03755
kevin.n.dunbar@dartmouth.edu

Phoebe C. Ellsworth
University of Michigan
Department of Psychology
525 East University
Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1109
pce@umich.edu

Jonathan St. B. T. Evans
University of Plymouth
Centre for Thinking and Language
School of Psychology
Plymouth PL4 8AA UK
J.Evans@plymouth.ac.uk

Shane Frederick
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Sloan School of Management
Room E5-317
15 Memorial Drive
Cambridge, MA 02142-1507
shane.fre@mit.edu

Jonathan Fugelsang
Dartmouth College
Department of Psychological & Brain Sciences
Hanover, NH 03755
jonf@dartmouth.edu

Charles R. Gallistel
Rutgers University
Psychology and Rutgers Center for Cognitive Science
152 Frelinghuyzen Road
Piscataway, NJ 08854-8800
galliste@ruccs.rutgers.edu

Rochel Gelman
Rutgers University
Psychology and Rutgers Center for Cognitive Science
152 Frelinghuyzen Road
Piscatawy, NJ 08854-8800
rgelman@ruccs.rutgers.edu

Lila Gleitman
University of Pennsylvania
Departments of Psychology and Linguistics
Institute for Research in Cognitive Science
3401 Walnut St. – 4th floor
Philadelphia, PA 19104
gleitman@cattell.psych.upenn.edu

Vinod Goel
York University
Department of Psychology
Toronto, Ontario
Canada M3J 1P3
vgoel@yorku.ca

Robert L. Goldstone
Indiana University
Psychology Department
Psychology Building
1101 E 10th St.
Bloomington, IN 47405-7007
rgoldst@indiana.edu

Patricia M. Greenfield
University of California, Los Angeles
Department of Psychology
Franz Hall
Los Angeles, CA 90095-1565
greenfield@psych.ucla.edu

Graeme S. Halford
University of Queensland
School of Psychology
Brisbane
Queensland 4072
Australiak
ghs@psy.uq.edu.au

E. Tori Higgins
Columbia University
Department of Psychology
405 D Schermerhorn
Mail Code 5501
New York, NY 10027-5501
tory@psych.columbia.edu
Vimla L. Patel  
Columbia University  
Department of Biomedical Informatics and Psychiatry  
Vanderbilt Clinic-5 622 West 168th Street  
New York, NY 10032  
patel@dbmi.columbia.edu

David N. Perkins  
Harvard Graduate School of Education  
Project Zero  
15 Longfellow Hall, Appian Way  
Cambridge, MA 02138  
david_perkins@harvard.edu

Jean E. Pretz  
Department of Psychology  
Illinois Wesleyan University  
P.O. Box 2900  
Bloomington, IL 61702-2900  
jpretz@iwu.edu

Arthur S. Reber  
Brooklyn College of CUNY  
Department of Psychology  
2900 Bedford Avenue  
Brooklyn, NY 11210  
areber@brooklyn.cuny.edu

Lance J. Rips  
Northwestern University  
Department of Psychology  
2029 Sheridan Road  
Evanston, IL 60208  
rrips@northwestern.edu

Ron Ritchhart  
Harvard Graduate School of Education  
Project Zero  
124 Mount Auburn Street  
Cambridge, MA 02138  
ron_ritchhart@pz.harvard.edu

Timothy A. Salthouse  
University of Virginia  
Department of Psychology  
Charlottesville, VA 22904-4400  
salthouse@virginia.edu

Eldar B. Shafir  
Princeton University  
Department of Psychology and the Woodrow Wilson School of Public Affairs  
Green Hall  
Princeton, NJ 08544  
shafir@princeton.edu

Steven A. Sloman  
Brown University  
Cognitive & Linguistic Sciences  
Box 1976  
Providence, RI 02912  
Steven_Sloman@brown.edu

Ji Yun Son  
Indiana University  
Psychology Department  
Psychology Building  
1101 E 10th St.  
Bloomington, IN 47405-7007  
jys@indiana.edu

Robert J. Sternberg  
PACE Center  
Yale University  
P.O. Box 208358  
New Haven, CT 06520-8358  
robert.sternberg@yale.edu

Michael Tomasello  
Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology  
Deutscher Platz 6  
D-04103 Leipzig, Germany  
tomas@eva.mpg.de

Barbara Tversky  
Stanford University  
Department of Psychology  
Building 420  
Stanford, CA 94305-2130  
btt@psych.stanford.edu

Jiawei Zhang  
School of Health Information Sciences  
University of Texas at Houston  
7000 Fannin, Suite 600  
Houston, TX 77030  
Jiawei.Zhang@uth.tmc.edu